

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
A. Program Information				
Program Mission Statement				
How many criteria are met for the Program Mission statement?	Exceeds expectations for all 8 criteria - Excellent	Exceeds expectations for all 8 criteria - Excellent	Exceeds expectations for all 8 criteria - Excellent	Exceeds expectations for all 8 criteria - Excellent
Reader Feedback	It is clear that Puente seeks to increase student interest and success in university level course work, but it was unclear exactly if the focus is entirely on English (reading, writing, and critical thinking) skills, or not. Is the idea that strong language skills equal success, or is math and science part of the mission as well?		Puente's mission statement meets all criteria. However, it could have elaborated on its "aspirational goals for the future" in this section. Overall, a great example of what a mission statement should look like.	
Program Learning Outcomes				
Overall, this section:	Addresses all 5 criteria - Meets the Standard	Exceeds expectations for all 5 criteria - Excellent	Addresses all 5 criteria - Meets the Standard	Exceeds expectations for all 5 criteria - Excellent
Reader Feedback	While it looks like you have met all of the required criteria, I would suggest using Bloom's taxonomy to	Overall I think these PLOs meet all the criteria. In terms of language that is easily understood, it's	Overall, the PLOs are clear and student-centered. Using verbs like "build" and "grow" allows for the	

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
	strengthen\ the PLOs around the second criteria (PLO statements reflect levels of learning).	difficult in what is meant to be a concise statement, to elaborate on what those "critical" and "writing skills" are, in order for a student to understand the expectations of them to master those skills	program to assess student success through a qualitative approach. I believe this is just as important as quantitative measures for an objective assessment of the student's overall experience in Puente.	

B. FTES - Enrollment Trends

1. What does the FTES data trend indicate?	FTES has decreased over the time span by 11% to 30%- Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard		FTES has decreased over the time span by 11% to 30%- Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	FTES has decreased over the time span by 11% to 30%- Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard
--	--	--	--	--

FTES Narrative Explanation - *Discuss the factors that would help the college understand these trends and whether there are tangible reasons for no change/flat, an increase or decrease in the trend.*

Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes all 4 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 4 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 4 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 4 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
---------------------------	---	---	---	---

FTES Action Narrative (if applicable) - *Describe the proposed actions for stabilizing/increasing the FTES.*

Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
---------------------------	---	---	--	---

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Reader Feedback	N/A	While both narratives meet standards, an acknowledgment of what is out of control of department and education. While I believe the PUENTE program does what it can in its control to retain students, there are things out of the control of the program mentors, faculty, and counselors that can affect FTES.	Great idea to move ENGL 1B to the spring! This allow students to, not only re-take ENGL 1A (if needed), but also encourages them to strengthen their language/literature skills through creative writing courses. More details could have been provided regarding the plans to "continue working closely with PTT".	<p>The actions you propose make sense. Some questions: Is FTES for the program based only on English 1A, 1B, and CRLP 71? Has the program explored embedded tutoring models or dedicated tutoring through the TLC? If so, what as been the experience?</p> <p>The proposed action to sequence lit or CRWR courses between 1A and 1B suggests that decreased FTES is not only due to some non-success between 1A and 1B, but also some persistence challenges. Are there students who pass 1A but don't continue to 1B? If so, why? Are the CRWR and LIT classes included in the FTES data?</p>

C. Sections - Enrollment Trends

Section Narrative Explanation (If Applicable) - *Explain why the number of sections is flat, increased or decreased.*

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes 3 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent	The narrative includes all 4 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes 3 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard
Section Narrative Explanation (If Applicable) - Explain why the number of sections increased while FTES decreased.				
Overall, in this section:		The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative is not included	The narrative is not included
Reader Feedback	Reasons addressed the department's attempts to request additional cohorts, but budget constraints are not necessarily within the department's control.		N/A	
D. Productivity - Enrollment Trends				
1. What does the data indicate about the productivity trend?	The program productivity trend has increased or has reached its maximum - Excellent	The program productivity trend has increased or has reached its maximum - Excellent	The program productivity trend has increased or has reached its maximum - Excellent	The program productivity trend has increased or has reached its maximum - Excellent
Productivity Narrative Explanation (If Applicable) - Explain why the productivity is flat, increased or decreased.				
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
Productivity Action Narrative (If Applicable) - Describe the proposed actions for stabilizing/increasing the productivity number.				

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Overall, in this section:		The narrative is not included	The narrative is not included	The narrative is not included
Reader Feedback	Productivity changes resulting from AB705 and the resulting curricular changes in the English department are not within this department's control, but it doesn't seem there is more to add in here.			

E. Enrollment by Student Demographics

a. Enrollment by Gender

Enrollment by Gender Narrative Explanation - *Explain why the enrollment rates is flat, increased or decrease for male, female, or non-binary.*

Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
2. Does your program differ in the percentage of males to females, in this most recent year, compared to the College? (College 2019-20 = 51% Female, 47% Male)	The difference between the gender/sex is between 21% to 30% - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The difference between the gender/sex is between 21% to 30% - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The difference between the gender/sex is between 21% to 30% - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The difference between the gender/sex is between 11% to 20% - Meets the Standard

Enrollment by Gender Action Narrative (If Applicable) - *What is the source of gender disparity and what proposed/planned actions is the program taking to achieve parity?*

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard

b. Enrollment by Ethnicity

Does your program differ in enrollment distribution among ethnic groups, in this most recent year, compared to the College enrollment by ethnic group? (2019-20 College enrollment distribution by ethnicity: 4% African American, 38% Asian, 5% Filipinx, 25% Latinx, 0% Native American, 1% Pacific Islander, 21% White, 4% Decline to State)	The enrollment does not mirror the college's ethnic distribution - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The enrollment does not mirror the college's ethnic distribution – Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The enrollment does not mirror the college's ethnic distribution – Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The enrollment does not mirror the college's ethnic distribution - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard
---	--	--	--	--

Enrollment by Ethnicity Narrative Explanation (If Applicable) - *Explain changes identified over the past five years for each ethnic group (address each ethnic group by bullet point).*

Overall, in this section:	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
---------------------------	---	---	---	---

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Enrollment by Ethnicity Action Narrative (If Applicable) - Describe the proposed actions for addressing disparities in enrollment by ethnic group within the program.				
Overall, in this section:	The narrative is not included	The narrative is not included	The narrative is not included	The narrative is not included
Reader Feedback	The narratives in this section address the questions in the template very clearly, thoroughly, and thoughtfully.		N/A	The explanation provided for this section is logical.
F. Student Course Success				
a. Student Course Success				
1. What does the data trend indicate about overall course success?	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Student Course Success Narrative Explanation - If the data trend shows an increase, decrease, or no change in students' course success percentage, explain what programmatic factors led to such a trend.				
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard
Student Course Success Action Narrative (If Applicable) - Describe the proposed actions for stabilizing/increasing the student's course success percentages.				

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative exceeds expectations - the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative exceeds expectations - the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent
Reader Feedback	There were some parts that weren't clear to someone unfamiliar with the Puente program, such as PPT. And in the previous section, the explanation did not include reasons within the department's control; however, that seems reasonable considering implications coming down from state mandates, like AB705.		The action items listed are detailed and meet all criteria. This is a great example of what action items should look like.	N/A

b. Student Course Success by Student Groups

3. Is there a course success gap between African-American, Latinx, Filipinx student groups and Asian, Native American, Pacific Islander, White, Decline to State student groups?	There is no gap between the two groups - Excellent	The gap between the two groups has decreased over the time span – Meets the Standard	The gap between the two groups has increased over the time span - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
--	--	--	--

Course Success by Student Groups Narrative Explanation - *Explain why the course success gap is flat, increased or decreased.*

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
Course Success by Student Groups Action Narrative (If Applicable) - <i>What actions are program faculty and staff engaged in to decrease the course success gap between African-American, Latinx, and Filipinx student groups and Asian, Native American, Pacific Islander, White, and Decline to State student groups?</i>				
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
Reader Feedback	The questions in this section do not seem to apply to the Puente program's mission. The narrative sections provided explanations as much as could be expected.	The action items lack data that support that critical race theory, validation theory, and can increase success.	Narrative explains the inclusive learning environment that's fostered in a Puente class. Student-centered approach that allows students of all ethnicities to learn through their experiences and backgrounds. This fosters a learning environment for students to be successful. However, there are no new action items listed to improve student success.	N/A

G. Student Course Success by Demographics

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
a. Student Course Success by Gender				
What does the data indicate about course success?				
Female	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Male	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Non-binary	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard
Course Success by Gender Narrative Explanation - <i>If the data trend shows an increase, decrease, or no change/flat in the male, female, or non-binary student course success percentages, explain why the percentage is flat, increased or decreased.</i>				
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Course Success by Gender Action Narrative (If Applicable) - Describe proposed actions to stabilize/increase the course success rates for either male, female, or non-binary.				
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative exceeds expectations - the narrative could be used as an exemplar - Excellent
Reader Feedback	Measurability of monitoring the College Promise impacts on students is not clear.	The course success lacks reasons inside of department control, but the cultural context of the program inform these reasons. I very much appreciate this section in addresses the nuances of being a student, in a world where factors outside of education play a huge role in the "success/failure" of students.	Meet all criteria. Adding more family engagement events can benefit student success. Families will have a better understanding of Puente expectations for students and can be more supportive at home.	The outreach to student families is particularly relevant and could be highlighted in the presentation to Advisory Council.
b. Student Course Success by Ethnicity				
What does the data trend indicate about program student course success by ethnicity?				
African Americans	Course success has been flat or decreased over the	Course success has been flat or decreased over the	Course success has improved over the time span - Excellent	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
	time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard		2 percentage point - Meets the Standard
Asian	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard
Filipinx	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Latinx	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points - Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Native American	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard
Pacific Islander	Course success has been flat or decreased over the	Course success has been flat or decreased over the	Course success has been flat or decreased over the	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
	time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	2 percentage point - Meets the Standard
White	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard
Decline to State	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point - Meets the Standard

Student Course Success by Ethnicity Narrative Explanation (If Applicable) - *If the data trend shows a decrease in any of the student ethnic groups' course success rates, explain why the percentage decreased for each (address each ethnic group by bullet point).*

Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
---------------------------	--	---	---	---

Student Course Success by Ethnicity Narrative Explanation (If Applicable) - *Describe the reasons for the gap in course success.*

Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
---------------------------	--	---	--	---

Student Course Success by Ethnicity Action Narrative (If Applicable) - *Describe the proposed actions for stabilizing/improving the course success by ethnicity.*

Puente Program Review

Rubric Evaluation	Amy Sarver (Same Division Faculty)	Laura Gamez (Faculty At-Large)	Alejandro Favel (Classified Staff At-Large)	Valerie Fong (Dean)
Overall, in this section:	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria - Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria - Meets the Standard
Reader Feedback	The narratives in this section provide clear and strong explanations of the challenges in considering changes to enrollments based on ethnicity in a program that is specifically designed to promote student success in Latinx students. It seems as though the template provided in this program review does not provide adequate measures of performance, nor does it allow for reflection in a meaningful way--at least not for this program.	In general I very much agree with the writers feedback on the template. While technically some standards were not met. The template does not reflect the qualitative data that could be rich to parse out some of intricacies of such program. So while there lacks data in some areas, it doesn't mean it is an inferior response. Equity programs such as these, sometimes don't seem "successful" or lack in certain areas. But it's due to the nature of the program. Thus reviewing it under standards which don't fall in the program's mission is difficult.	Great use of the last section to "provide feedback on the template or address a topic that was not previously discussed". Some of the student demographic data observed is not helpful for a program like Puente since they serve predominately Latinx students. They provide qualitative/anecdotal data which I believe should also be considered when reviewing programs.	N/A